# Mapping Christianity in China, 1550-1950

Developing Relational and Geospatial Tools for the Study of Christianity in China

### Thursday-Saturday, 19-21 November 2020

An online workshop hosted by Boston University Center for Global Christianity and Mission, with major financial support from the Boston University Institute on Culture, Religion and World Affairs (CURA) & the Boston University Center for the Study of Asia (BUCSA).

The China Historical Christian Database (CHCD) is a powerful new tool being developed for the study of Christianity in China. It is a geographic and relational database for Christian people, institutions, and events in China between 1550 and 1950. It maps where every church, school, hospital, convent, orphanage, and the like were located in China, and it lists the foreigners and Chinese people who worked inside them. By combining this geographic and relational data with an online tool, the project gives scholars and students the ability to view the dynamic nature of the Christian presence in China in a way that is both intuitive and innovative.

The Mapping Christianity in China Workshop is designed to meet two integral needs at this stage in the project's development. First, it will bring together leading scholars and archivists from around the world to discuss how the CHCD can be transformative for the study of China and East-West relations. Second, the workshop will provide the opportunity to solidify international partnerships.









## PROGRAM DETAILS (Click Headings to Jump to Section)

### **New Online Program**

Given the difficulties in travel and the COVID emergency, we have transitioned to an online program format, using the platform ZOOM. See section for more details.

#### Honoraria

We will offer honoraria to our presenters and rapporteurs for their efforts and contribution, scaled according to presence over the three days. See section for more details.

## SHORT PROGRAM (Click Headings to Jump to Section)

### Day 1: Thursday, 19 November 2020

Zoom Meeting: 8:15 - 10:30 AM, US East Standard Time (EST)

- 8:15 8:30: Connection & Common Introductions
- 8:30 10:00: Two Parallel Online Panels in Separate Virtual Rooms
- 10:00 10:30: Common Discussion

**Session 1: Lessons from Other Projects I.** Spatial and Biographical Databases on Chinese and Global History. [3 panelists; 20 mins. + 5 mins. Q&A each]

**Session 2**: Lessons from Other Projects II. Bibliographical and Textual Databases in the field of Christianity in China. [3 panelists; 20 mins. + 5 mins. Q&A each]

### Day 2: Friday, 20 November 2020

Zoom Meeting: 8:30 - 10:30 AM, US East Standard Time (EST)

- 8:30 10:00: Two Parallel Online Panels in Separate Virtual Rooms
- 10:00 10:30: Common Discussion

**Session 3**: **Sources**. How to Leverage Archives and Collections on Christianity in China and Sino-Western Relations in the Digital Age [4 panelists; 15 mins. + 5 mins. Q&A each]

**Session 4: Networks**. What Scholars Imagine & What Digital Humanities Could Deliver [4 panelists: 15 mins. + 5 mins. Q&A each]

### Day 3: Saturday, 21 November 2020

Zoom Meeting: 8:30 - 10:30 AM US East Standard Time (EST)

- 8:30 9:00: Introduction
- 9:00 10:30: Roundtable, Moderated by Organizers and Rapporteurs

Session 5: The China Historical Christian Database. Suggestions for the Future, A Roundtable

## **NEW ONLINE FORMAT**

Given the difficulties in travel and the COVID emergency, we have transitioned to an online program format, using the platform ZOOM. We have reduced the daily meeting time to a series of **three 2-hour (approx.) ZOOM meetings, once per day, on Thursday, Friday and Saturday NO-VEMBER 19, 20, and 21, 2020.** 

On **Thursday** we will meet a bit earlier to welcome all, at **8:15 AM**, and will continue until **10:30 AM**, **US East Standard Time (EST).** On Thursday we will run two parallel sessions for 90 minutes, and then have a final plenary discussion for 30 minutes. On Friday and Saturday, we will start at **8:30 AM** and continue until **10:30 AM**, **US EST**. On Friday, again, we will run two parallel sessions for 90 minutes, and have a final plenary discussion for 30 minutes; on Saturday, instead all the meeting will be held in plenary session as a roundtable.

We have selected this time slot so that our participants in East Asia (PRC and Taiwan; EST + 13 hrs) can join between the hours of 21:15/21:30 and 23:30, and our friends in Europe can connect in the afternoon there. Our friends in other US time zone will have to present or join early in the morning for them. We have scheduled such presenters for the later part of each session. We are grateful to all for waking up early or staying up late!

## HONORARIA

We will offer **honoraria to our presenters and rapporteurs** for their efforts and contribution, scaled according to presence over the three days (information will be sent individually). We ask presenters to produce a **written presentation text** (or suggest a relevant reading that can be shared) and **possibly a PowerPoint of the presentation**, so that we can later have a solid record of the proceedings. Organizers and rapporteurs will help with technical navigation in the sessions and note taking + coordination of discussions. **The workshop will be open to select invited guests who have expressed interest in the project**. Guest attendees will type in the Zoom chat their questions, fielded by the rapporteurs/moderators.

As detailed in the schedule below, on our **first day**, after briefly introducing the CHCD (already known to presenters in its technical contents through our pre-circulated White Paper and other materials) and managing the Zoom etiquette, in **Parallel Session 1** we will have three senior experts in the field of Chinese digital humanities present their assessment of spatial and biographical projects in Chinese and global history they have developed, sharing with us the challenges, problems, and lessons we need to consider in developing the CHCD. In **Parallel Session 2**, we will hear from three experts in the field of Christianity in China in the US, Europe and the PRC, who have developed impressive online biographical, bibliographic and textual resources. Their presentations highlight how in the field of Christianity in China so far priority has been given to online bibliography and reproduction of texts, much less to biography and spatial analysis and relational databases (the pioneering biographical database for the history of Christianity in China at the Ricci Institute, University of San Francisco, is temporarily unavailable due to obsolescence of its 1990s online architecture). Their experience will teach us what they have done well and how to work together as institutions and scholars, but also where the CHCD can make a unique contribution, and revive, for example, the efforts of the now virtually retired Ricci Database.

During the **second day**, in **Parallel Session 3**, with the help of archivists and scholars, we will discuss the issue of *sources*, broadly conceived also to include images and photographs, and how to leverage the *analog* richness of archives and collections around the world to create a new *digital* biographical and spatial relational repository such as the CHCD. **Parallel Session 4** will tackle the idea of *networks* and how they can be captured and visualized, both as prosopographies and in space. Scholars of Chinese-Western relations and Christianity in China (both Catholicism and Protestantism) will offer five case studies and illustrate the kind of research questions the CHCD public might have in mind when approaching the database. More traditional cases of prosopography (based on analysis of kinship; patronage; education) will be accompanied by examples of digitally-supported social network analyses.

On the **third day**, **Plenary Session 5** will be completely devoted to offering feedback on the CHCD, so as to tailor it as a resource that is more responsive to the needs of the field at large. This session will also provide the opportunity to solidify international partnerships. A project of this scale requires collaboration to gather and input the enormous amounts of data that are geographically dispersed, and which exist in many different languages. After opening remarks by Dr. Ireland on behalf of the BU Team on institutional synergies, we will open the floor in a **Roundtable**, where we will invite, under the guidance of our moderators/rapporteurs, presenters and guest attendees to comment in detail on a host of possible issues (technological, institutional, and financial) affecting projects like the CHCD.

## FULL PROGRAM

## Day 1: Sessions 1 & 2

Thursday, 19 November 2020

Zoom Meeting: 8:15 - 10:30 AM, US East Standard Time (EST)

- 8:15 8:30: Connection & Common Introductions
- 8:30 10:00: Two Parallel Online Panels in Separate Virtual Rooms
- 10:00 10:30: Common Discussion

### Session 1: Lessons From Other Projects I

Spatial and Biographical Databases on Chinese and Global History.

Each panelist will have a 20 minute presentation with 5 minutes of Q & A.

## The Goals of the China Historical GIS and the China Biographical Database: Lessons for Other Projects.

Peter BOL, Professor, Department of East Asian Languages and Cultures, Harvard University

The China Historical GIS and the China Biographical Database were created to establish a common base database for China's administrative geography and persons in history respectively. Each is intended to serve research in many fields rather than being a reflection of a specific researcher's interests or an aid to a specific research question. This poses challenges for the designers, but also for novice users.

#### Toward a World-Historical Gazetteer.

Ruth MOSTERN, Associate Professor, Department of History, and Director, Center for World History, University of Pittsburgh

A great deal of historical spatial information takes the form of place names, since named locations represent sites of significance to people in the past. Historical gazetteers are databases that structure information about named places in the past and their attributes. At the scale of individual research, a gazetteer can be a useful tool for organizing and presenting research findings. For an expert community, that can be an exceptional reference work. With tools and methods that permit multiple specialist gazetteers to be searched and used together, a network of gazetteers becomes a key piece of digital history infrastructure. This talk will introduce space as a concept, digital gazetteers as a genre, and the World-Historical Gazetteer (www.whqazetteer.org) as a resource and a project.

# Spatial Logic of Local Governance in China, 1644-1911—Based on China Government Employee Database - Qing (CGED-Q) 中国历史官员量化数据库(清代).

Heng HU 胡恒, Associate Professor and Vice-Director, Qing History Institute, Renmin University of China, Beijing

The establishment of Qing history (1644-1911) databases and the subsequent quantification of historical research in China have overcome the lack of systemic statistical data in traditional historical research and other serious deficiencies in statistical research. Recently, James Lee and Cameron Campbell's Research Group at the Hong Kong University of Science and Technology have established a major new database entitled 'The Qing China Government Employee Database'. I have also joined their collaborative project to analyze this database, with my research project "Spatial Logic of Local Governance in China during 1644-1911—based on the Qing China Government Employee Database." This database, is based on the major source Jinshenlu 縉紳錄. From 1644 to 1911, the Qing government and private publishers issued a 'record of officials' every three months, which records the names and particulars of all civil and sometimes military officials. This collection contains 5 to 6 million records of government officials. My project consists of two parts. First is a quantitative analysis on the administrative division and the distribution of bureaucratic resources of the Qing dynasty. Through the systemic tracking, quantitative statistics and GIS analysis of the Qing classification of administrative districts in terms of strategic position, complexity of administrative condition, financial conditions, and public security, it can be seen how the Qing Dynasty used geographical information to allocate limited bureaucratic resources, and how the government deliberately promoted frontier regions to attract officials with better administrative capabilities. By further exploring how political distinctions affected the origin, selection and promotion of officials, I can also provide a long-term perspective to understand the selection system of contemporary Chinese officials. The second part is a research on the 'Dispute of Regional Avoidance' in the Qing dynasty. Appointments outside one's native place or province ('regional avoidance') is one of the basic characteristics of the Chinese bureaucracy. Very different from the traditions of local appointments in the West, this system has determined the promotion and space mobilization of officials in Chinese history. In the Qing dynasty, the debate surrounding regional avoidance was vigorous, and this part of the project will focus on the discussion about avoidance problems in different periods.

### Session 2: Lessons from Other Projects II

Bibliographical and Textual Databases in the field of Christianity in China.

Each panelist will have a 20 minute presentation with 5 minutes of Q & A.

## Lessons Learned from the Development of the Chinese Christian Texts Database (CCT-Database).

Nicolas STANDAERT, Professor, Sinology Research Unit, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven (Belgium)

The Chinese Christian Texts Database (CCT-Database) is a research database of primary and secondary sources concerning the cultural contacts between China and Europe in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries (from 1582 to ca. 1840). It provides references to ca. 1,050 Chinese and ca. 4,000 European documents dating from roughly the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, and in addition to over 8,000 secondary sources. In the course of its 15-year online existence, the Database had to adapt several times its system. The presentation will introduce the Database and share the lessons learned from its development.

#### The Experience of Building the Chinese Christian Bibliography Database 汉语基督教文献书目数据库.

Qinghe XIAO 肖清和, Associate Professor, Department of History, and Associate Director, Center for Religion and Chinese Society, Shanghai University

In 2012, the China National Social Science Foundation funded the project 'Collection and Research on Christian Materials in Chinese' by our Shanghai University Research Team on the History of Christianity in China 上海大学中国基督教史研究团队. As one of the research results of this project, the team established the 'Chinese Christian Bibliography Database' 汉语基督教文献书目数据库. This database contains more than 30,000 bibliographic entries, including collections, institutions, authors, abstracts and so on. This database provides a very good reference for the construction of the BU Chinese Christian History Database, and related data should be shared with each other, so as to reduce redundancy and waste of resources. I will briefly introduce the background, main content, and features of the Chinese Christian Bibliography Database in order to provide a reference for the Chinese Christian History Database.

#### Dynamic Mapping and Digital Humanities: A Brief Look Back and Persistent Problems.

Mark MIR, Archivist & Resource Coordinator, Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History, University of San Francisco

In 1997, two initiatives that foreshadow the CHCD appeared. Neither met with unalloyed success. ECAI (Electronic Cultural Atlas Initiative) and the Ricci Institute's 21st Century Roundtable. Of these two, ECAI was far larger and more organized. Founded by Emeritus Prof. Lewis Lancaster of the University of California, Berkeley, ECAI was designed around the idea of maps and mapping as the most logical and accessible medium to advance education and research in the humanities and social sciences through increased attention to time and place. ECAI collaborated with many major research organizations around the world, setting standards for use and interoperability. The Ricci Institute's 21st Century Roundtable project, on the other hand, was far smaller and more tightly focused (in spite of the enormity of the topic): a database of Christianity in China not unlike the CHCD but which started with accumulating data rather than map technology itself. Like the CHCD, it had sections for people, places, institutions, bibliographies, and so on. In those days before data sharing and Wikis existed, the idea was to have scholars working in the field contribute data that could be posted on the WWW of the 1990's. On being introduced to the CHCD project it became clear that while the technology has vastly improved, many of the same problems encountered more than twenty years ago persist.

### Day 2: Sessions 3 & 4

Friday, 20 November 2020

Zoom Meeting: 8:30 - 10:30 AM, US East Standard Time (EST)

- 8:30 10:00: Two Parallel Online Panels in Separate Virtual Rooms
- 10:00 10:30: Common Discussion

#### Session 3: Sources

# How to Leverage Archives and Collections on Christianity in China and Sino-Western Relations in the Digital Age

Each panelist will have a 15 minute presentation with 5 minutes of Q & A.

## The Acquisition, Development, Contents, and Uses of the China Records Project and the United Board for Christian Higher Education in Asia at the Day Missions Collection.

Chris ANDERSON, Special Collections Librarian and Curator of the Day Missions Collection at Yale University Divinity Library

The Day Missions Collection of Yale Divinity Library is one of the largest collections on Protestant mission studies in North America and one of the largest collections on Chinese missions and Chinese Christianity in the world. I will offer an overview of the Day Missions Collection with specific attention to the acquisition, development, contents, and uses of the China Records Project and the United Board for Christian Higher Education in Asia. When combined, both collections include over 750 linear feet of archival records comprising over 25,000 folders on organizational records, historical correspondence, journals, diaries, pamphlets, photographs, and ephemera. Participation in a collaborative project like CHCD that documents and spotlights the historical spaces of mission in China, including custom lists, maps, and digital visualizations of missionary activities can highlight the rich and diverse archival collections on China of the Yale Divinity Library.

#### Existing Compiled Data on the History of Protestant Missionaries in China.

Xian LIU 刘贤, Associate Professor, Qing History Institute, Renmin University of China, Beijing

Several primary and secondary sources offer precious materials to populate the CHCD on the history of Protestantism in China. The journal Chinese Recorder (1867-1941), a fundamental source for Chinese Protestant history, for example, contains news about the arrival of missionaries and obituaries for missionaries who died in China. The existing online index is a first way to explore the collection, searching for any name or institution. Another important resource is the 'Bates List', compiled by Miner Searle Bates (1897-1978), professor in Jinling University and later at Yale University. Finally, rich biographical materials on Protestantism were compiled in the 1990s-2000s by the late Professors Daniel Bays and Gary Tiedemann for the Ricci 21st Century Roundtable database at the Ricci Institute of the University of San Francisco, records which are temporarily unavailable for technical reasons. In my presentation, I will share my knowledge of Protestant journals, data, lists and some new books, to offer more convenient and authoritative data resources.

## The American Passionist Missions in Western Hunan (1921-1955): A Spatial Analysis based on Archival Holdings.

**Robert CARBONNEAU**, Historian, Saint Paul of the Cross Province, Passionist Congregation, & Adjunct Faculty, University of Scranton, Pennsylvania

Among American Roman Catholic missionaries who served in the Yuanling diocese, West Hunan, China, were American Passionist religious priests and one brother, the Sisters of Charity from Convent Station, New Jersey, and the Sisters of St. Joseph, Baden, Pennsylvania. The latter two congregations included Chinese members. To create the electronic spatial data base summary I propose combining statistical membership found in relevant links at the Passionist Historical Archives website and digitized archival resources from the Passionist China Collection as summarized in the following article. "The Passionist China Collection Photo Archive" Trans Asia Photography 4.2 (Spring 2014) Permalink: http://hdl.handle.net/2027/spo.7977573.0004.209.

#### The True Jesus Church and its Networks in Modern China.

Melissa Wei-tsing INOUYE, Historian, Church History Department, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City (Utah), & Senior Lecturer, School of Cultures, Languages, & Linguistics, University of Auckland, New Zealand.

Many early leaders of the True Jesus Church were Christian merchants whose shops sometimes served as church meeting quarters. The means and connections they brought allowed the True Jesus Church to fund an aggressive print ministry in its early days and drove its initial rapid expansion in North China. The True Jesus Church's emphasis on charismatic experience and authority also drove a schismatic culture, with regular defections that seasoned Christian culture in surrounding areas. While the church's strong exclusivist culture seems to have prevented leaders from forming strong ecumenical ties, its ethos of evangelism ensured that interactions between True Jesus Church members and members of other churches occurred regularly, and its criticism of foreign mission institutions gave it a distinctive voice in the Chinese Christian community.

#### Session 4: Networks

#### What Scholars Imagine & What Digital Humanities Could Deliver

Each panelist will have a 15 minute presentation with 3 minutes of Q & A.

#### The Global Connections of Catholic Missionaries (before 1800).

**Eugenio MENEGON**, Associate Professor, Department of History and Center for Global Christianity and Mission, Boston University

The CHCD, as it is now conceived, focuses on gathering biographical and spatial data on Christian Chinese and foreign historical actors and institutions between 1550 and 1950 in China itself (i.e. in the territories occupied by the former Ming and Qing Empires and the Republic of China), including Macau, Hong Kong and Taiwan. However, Christian actors and institutions were very much transnational and global in nature, connecting China with many countries across the world. While at this time our focus firmly remains on China for evident limits of time and scope, potentially the database could one day branch out and connect to other "global" data subset being built by others. Using the example of two historical actors from the old China Catholic mission, the Italian Jesuit Antonio Provana and his Chinese companion Louis Fan Shouyi, sent by the Kangxi Emperor to Pope Clement XI in Rome in the eighteenth century as imperial envoys, I will illustrate the extensive prosopographical and spatial ramifications of their lives both in Europe and China, and the fact that many Christian historical actors across four centuries, just like them, were born, educated, or spent time and traveled not only in China, but also in other Asian countries, Europe, the Americas and so on. These individuals were at the core of vast global networks of kinship, patronage, economic, cultural and religious relations on several continents. How can we capture that global dimension in the CHCD?

#### Mapping Knowledge Circulation in and beyond Qing China.

**Prof. Catherine JAMI,** Directrice de Recherche, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique & Centre d'Études sur la Chine Moderne et Contemporaine, Paris, France.

The project 'Individual itineraries and the circulation of scientific and technical knowledge in China' was funded by the French National Research Agency (ANR) from 2010 to 2012. Its aim was to shed light on the impact of individuals' geographic mobility on the spatial dynamics of knowledge in late imperial China, where the bureaucratic system dictated a specific pattern of mobility for the elites. The question was also studied for other socio-professional groups—craftsmen and medical doctors—and for the actors of the globalization of knowledge—Christian missionaries, colonial doctors, and the Chinese students. The project combined a number of case studies with the development of a database. In this presentation I will focus on what we have learnt from this project that is relevant to the history of Christianity in China, and how digital humanities can contribute to a historiographical renewal in this field.

## Local and Transnational Relationships of Pentecostals in Hong Kong (1907-1942): A Social Network Analysis.

Alex MAYFIELD, PhD. Candidate, School of Theology and Center for Global Christianity and Mission, Boston University

Current scholarship on Pentecostal history tends to emphasize the global polycentric origin of the Pentecostal movement. Such approaches, however, do not explain how disparate centers of revival, pastors, evangelists, missionaries, and laypeople knit themselves into a self-acknowledged global movement. This paper will explore this process through a localized case study of Hong Kong, from 1907 to 1942. A social network analysis (SNA) of Pentecostal actors in the colony will explore the role of local and transnational relationships in transitioning the movement from a disunified revivalist fervor to more formal organizational structures. By shedding light on the actual process of institutionalization, this paper highlights the power of SNA as a historical methodology.

# Spatial and Familial Ties that Bind: Social and Geographic Mapping of Chinese Christians in South Fujian.

Chris WHITE, Assistant Director, Center on Religion and Chinese Society, Purdue University

This presentation will first give a brief overview of how Christian churches in Fujian have historically been mapped (beginning with missionary efforts in developing maps) and how they can be currently visualized through the Online Spiritual Atlas of China (OSAC). The second half of this presentation will center on how historical Christians in South Fujian (Chinese and foreign), including individuals, communities, and families, may be added to maps. Specifically, this portion of the talk will center on utilizing local sources, such as genealogies or commemorative church volumes, and how networks between individual Christians may be discovered.

### Day 3: Plenary Roundtable

Saturday, 21 November 2020

Zoom Meeting: 8:30 - 10:30 AM US East Standard Time (EST)

- 8:30 9:00: Introduction
- 9:00 10:30: Roundtable, Moderated by Organizers and Rapporteurs

### Session 5. The China Historical Christian Database

Suggestions for the Future, A Roundtable

#### Introduction: Institutional Synergies in the Digital Humanities - Hopes and Caveats.

**Daryl IRELAND**, Associate Director, Center for Global Christianity and Mission, and Visiting Assistant Research Professor, School of Theology, Boston University

Digital Humanities is an invitation for scholars to collaborate. For decades institutional incentives and professional accolades have been imagined to go to the humanist working alone and in a silo. But Digital Humanities envisions something different. The size of projects such as the CHCD requires multi-institutional collaboration and cooperation. Although it carries risks, it can also be extraordinarily generative. With information freely available and shared across disciplinary boundaries, an academic culture is created that encourages new initiatives and generates pathbreaking insights.

#### **Plenary Roundtable**

Based on the close reading of the pre-circulated CHCD White Paper, the sharing of a Beta CHCD Online, and the discussions and presentations during the Workshop, facilitators/rapporteurs will introduce key topics and encourage participants to share in a general forum their suggestions and criticisms, and to start forging institutional partner-ships and funding/labor alliances. Possible discussion topics during the roundtable could be:

- Technical obstacles
- New technologies
- Obsolescence
- Avoiding duplication of efforts
- Development
- Funding
- Institutional partnerships

- International division of labor
- A labor of love and money: inputting accurate data
- The role of undergraduate research assistants
- The role of graduate students in the History of Christianity in China and related fields
- The role of university faculty and other scholars in the History of Christianity in China and related fields
- The role of archivists, librarians and resource specialists